Summary of Phase I Archaeological Survey for the NICTD Double Track NWI, Gary, IN, to Michigan City, IN

Lake, Porter, and LaPorte Counties, Indiana

INDOT Des. No.
DHPA No. 19318
May 25, 2017
Summary of Phase I Archaeological Survey for the NICTD Double Track NWI, Michigan City, IN, to Gary, IN Lake, Porter, and LaPorte Counties, Indiana

May 2017

PREPARED FOR
Northern Indiana Commuter Transportation District
33 E. U.S. Highway 12
Chesterton, IN 46304

PREPARED BY
8550 W. Bryn Mawr Avenue, Suite 900
Chicago, IL 60631

FULL REPORT AUTHORS
James G. Parker, MA, RPA
Brandon M. Gabler, PhD, RPA
Jeanne Barnes
Diana Garnett
With contributions from Michelle Curby, Melissa Breyer, and Marshall Gaines
1.0 PROJECT SUMMARY

The Northern Indiana Commuter Transportation District (NICTD), on behalf of the Federal Transit Administration (FTA), contracted HDR to conduct cultural resources investigations for the proposed Double Track Northwest Indiana (DT-NWI) Project (Project) located along the South Shore Commuter Rail Line (the South Shore Line) for approximately 26.6 miles between Gary, Indiana, and Michigan City, Indiana.

This investigation was completed to assist FTA in meeting its regulatory obligations under Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act (NHPA) of 1966, as amended. The investigation was conducted in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and Guidelines for Archaeology and Historic Preservation and guidelines established by the Indiana Department of Transportation Cultural Resources Office (INDOT-CRO) and by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources Division of Historic Preservation and Archaeology (DHPA), which serves as the Indiana State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO).

This report presents a summary of the results of an archaeological investigation within the direct area of potential effects (APE), which includes the area extent located directly within the footprint of the proposed improvements. Most of the direct APE was contained within the NICTD right-of-way (ROW); however, some of the Project also entails the partial or total acquisition of multiple private properties adjacent to the rail line, as well as property adjacent to National Park Service (NPS) land (the Indiana Dunes National Lakeshore). The direct APE covers approximately 124.83 total acres.

Figure 1 through Figure 3 show the location of the Project in Lake, Porter, and LaPorte Counties. Table 1 lists the townships, ranges, and sections in which the Project is located.

Brandon M. Gabler, PhD, RPA, served as principal investigator for the Project and James Parker, MA, RPA, served as the Project Director. Both meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Professional Qualification Standards for Archaeology, as published in 36 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) 61. HDR staff conducted initial background research through the Indiana State Historic Architectural and Archaeological Research Database (SHAARD) to collect information on previously recorded archaeological sites. Jeanne Barnes conducted a review of records on file at the DHPA in August 2016 to collect information on previous surveys. Parker conducted additional background research between August and September 2016. The field investigation occurred in September (9–15 and 19–20) 2016 and April (3–12) 2017, directed by Parker, and assisted by archaeologists Marshall Gaines, Aaron Kidwell, Liz Kizior, and Lauren Osmialowski.

HDR conducted the background research between August and September 2016, and the field investigation of the direct APE was conducted in September (9–15 and 19–20) 2016 and April (3–12) 2017. The field survey included photo documentation, mapping, and a controlled surface inspection of the direct APE, followed by excavation of shovel test pits (STPs) in select portions of the direct APE. During the September 2016 investigation, much of the direct APE was found to have multiple buried utility lines (primarily fiber optic cable and gas pipelines) running parallel with both sides of the rail line(s) within and adjacent to the NICTD ROW, making it a safety hazard to conduct subsurface testing. Additionally, gravel access roads run parallel to the rail line(s) on one or both sides across a large portion of the NICTD ROW. Wetlands and drainage ditches are also located adjacent to the rail line(s) across a large section of the direct APE.
Figure 1. Regional map indicating the Project location.
Figure 2. USGS topographic map with the Project location indicated.
Figure 3. Aerial photograph with the Project location indicated.
Table 1. Townships, ranges, and sections in which the Project is located.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Township</th>
<th>Range</th>
<th>Section</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>38 N</td>
<td>4 W</td>
<td>28, 29, 31, 32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38 N</td>
<td>5 W</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37 N</td>
<td>5 W</td>
<td>1, 2, 9, 10, 16, 17, 18, 19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37 N</td>
<td>6 W</td>
<td>23, 24, 26, 27, 28, 31, 32, 33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37 N</td>
<td>7 W</td>
<td>35, 36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36 N</td>
<td>8 W</td>
<td>1, 2, 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36 N</td>
<td>7 W</td>
<td>5, 6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Four non-contiguous areas were subjected to subsurface testing during the September 2016 portion of the survey. However, the current direct APE, as of late March 2017, is overall narrower than the September 2016 one due to a reduction in the project’s construction footprint; as such, the four areas previously subjected to subsurface testing are now outside of the current direct APE.

During the April 2017 investigation, areas that were not accessible or that fell outside of the September 2016 direct APE were visited and documented. In most cases, the same conditions encountered during the September 2016 investigation—buried utility lines, wetlands, drainage ditches, and gravel access roads—existed in the newly added areas of the direct APE. The National Park Service areas adjacent to the rail corridor were also surveyed during this time, under Archaeological Resources Protection Act (ARPA) permit number 2017-6, issued from the Indiana Dunes National Lakeshore.

During the initial reconnaissance of the direct APE, one archaeological site was identified, an extant section of Old U.S. 12 in Burns Harbor, Porter County. Designated 12-Pr-0801, the site includes an approximately 2000-foot section of the road. Although the road has a long history in the region, having been a major transportation route since before its designation as a U.S. Highway in 1926, review of historic aerial photographs and topographic maps indicate the alignment was altered at some point in the early to mid-1960s, before ultimately being abandoned during the late 1960s when the current U.S. 12 was constructed. The extant sections therefore represent more recent alterations to the road and, as such, have little potential to yield pertinent information about the history of its use. HDR therefore recommends this site not eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP). No further work is recommended.

A total of six non-contiguous areas requiring subsurface testing were identified during the April 2017 investigation (Table 2)—from west to east, designated Gary 1 (0.73 acres), Gary 2 (1.42 acres), Portage/Ogden Dunes Station Parking Lot Extension (3.26 acres), Burns Harbor (0.31 acres), Dune Park Station Parking Lot Extension (3.44 acres), and Michigan City (2.88 acres). A total of 160 STPs were excavated in the six areas—10 in Gary 1, 20 in Gary 2, 50 in Portage/Ogden Dunes Station Parking Lot Extension, 2 in Burns Harbor, 60 in Dune Park Station Parking Lot Extension, and 18 in Michigan City. No prehistoric or historic materials were recovered from the STPs. However, based on review of historic aerial photographs and the presence of modern structural debris encountered on the surface, three sites were identified during the investigation—Site 12-La-0708, Site 12-La-0709, and Site 12-Pr-0802, respectively.
Table 2. Survey areas requiring subsurface testing, from west to east.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Acres</th>
<th>Shovel Tests</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gary 1</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Site 12-La-0708</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gary 2</td>
<td>1.42</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>Site 12-La-0709</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portage/Ogden Dunes Station Parking Lot Extension</td>
<td>3.26</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>No archaeological materials/sites</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burns Harbor</td>
<td>0.31</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>No archaeological materials/sites</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dune Park Station Parking Lot Extension</td>
<td>3.44</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>Site 12-Pr-0802</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michigan City</td>
<td>2.88</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>No archaeological materials/sites</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Site 12-La-0708 was identified as the former location of a structure based on structural debris scattered across the surface. Historic topographic maps and aerial photographs indicate the former structure likely dates from the 1940s/1950s, and was demolished after 1980 and prior to 1998. The current investigation excavated 10 shovel tests in the area; all were negative for prehistoric and historic materials. Additionally, the majority of shovel tests exhibited disturbed profiles. Based on the lack of intact deposits, HDR recommends this site as not eligible for listing in the NRHP. No further work is recommended.

Site 12-La-0709 was identified as the former location of a structure complex based on structural debris scattered across the surface. Historic topographic maps and aerial photographs indicate the former structures likely date from the 1950s, and were demolished between 1998 and 2002. The current investigation excavated 20 shovel tests in the area; all were negative for prehistoric and historic materials. Additionally, the majority of shovel tests exhibited disturbed profiles. Based on the lack of intact deposits, HDR recommends this site as not eligible for listing in the NRHP. No further work is recommended.

Site 12-Pr-0802 was identified as the former location of a structure based on the presence of a water-filled depression with a rectangular concrete fragment in the middle of it. Historic topographic maps and aerial photographs indicate the former structure likely dates from the 1920s/1930s, and was demolished after 1980 and prior to 1992. The current investigation excavated 60 shovel tests in the area; all were negative for prehistoric and historic materials. No subsurface deposits were encountered. Based on the lack of intact deposits, HDR recommends this site as not eligible for listing in the NRHP. No further work is recommended.
2.0 DISCUSSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The primary objective of the Phase I investigation was to identify all archaeological resources within the direct APE and recommend follow-up Phase II evaluation of any resources of undetermined eligibility for listing in the NRHP. The purpose of the NRHP is to list properties that are “significant in American history, architecture, archaeology and culture” (NHPA Section 101[a][1]). The implementing regulations of the NHPA provide the following criteria for evaluation:

- The quality of significance in American history, architecture, archaeology, engineering, and culture is present in districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects that possess integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association and
  - (a) that are associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or
  - (b) that are associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; or
  - (c) that embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or
  - (d) that have yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history (36 CFR 60.4).

HDR conducted the background research between August and September 2016, and the field investigation of the direct APE was conducted in September (9–15 and 19–20) 2016 and April (3–12) 2017. The field survey included photo documentation, mapping, and a controlled surface inspection of the direct APE, followed by excavation of STPs in select portions of the direct APE. During the September 2016 investigation, much of the direct APE was found to have multiple buried utility lines (primarily fiber optic cable and gas pipelines), running parallel with both sides of the rail line(s) within and adjacent to the NICTD ROW, making it a safety hazard to conduct subsurface testing. Additionally, gravel access roads run parallel to the rail line(s) on one or both sides across a large portion of the NICTD ROW. Wetlands and drainage ditches are also located adjacent to the rail line(s) across a large section of the direct APE.

During the initial reconnaissance of the direct APE, one archaeological site was identified, an extant section of Old U.S. 12 in Burns Harbor, Porter County. Designated 12-Pr-0801, the site is an approximately 2,000-foot section of the old highway. Based on its history of alterations and development through the 1960s until its abandonment later that decade, HDR recommends this site not eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP). No further work is recommended.

A total of six non-contiguous areas requiring subsurface testing were identified during the April 2017 investigation. These were investigated via a total of 160 STPs. No prehistoric or historic materials were recovered from the STPs. Based on review of historic aerial photographs and the presence of modern structural debris encountered on the surface, three sites were identified during the investigation—Site 12-La-0708, Site 12-La-0709, and Site 12-Pr-0802, respectively. HDR recommends each of these sites as not eligible for listing in the NRHP. No further work is recommended for any of these sites, and no additional archaeological investigation is recommended unless the project footprint changes.